

# Creative Arts as a Service Industry

CHRISTOPHER NAUGHTON

*University of Auckland*

## Abstract

*In the United Kingdom the creative arts education enterprise is underway. Rival creative arts organizations are offering schools ready made packages for their arts programme. With the reduction in provision of arts education within the Bachelor of Education in New Zealand it may not be long before schools similarly look to external agencies for support. As in the United Kingdom, this new vogue for the arts education comes at the same time as the 'Creative Arts Industry' has been popularised and promoted by government. This paper considers the implications of an industrial approach to the arts within tertiary education and the impact this has had in validating the linkage to the arts within schools.*

## Introduction

The philosophical basis of this paper comes from Nietzsche's interpretation of the deities of Apollo and Dionysus contextualised within the tragic stage play in ancient Greece. In *The Birth of Tragedy* (1999), Nietzsche depicts the human mind as vying between Apollonian 'order' and Dionysian chaos. These two ways of perceiving art emphasize the rational individual in Apollo, contrasted with the loss of individualism invoked by Dionysus. In the 'Creative Arts Industry' it is the individual experience of the artist that is recognised not the artist within a Dionysian community. As an individual the artist becomes a marketable commodity, a product. As a member of a community the artist becomes invisible in terms of the rationalistic industrial concept of the arts. The Dionysian therefore remains hidden from view for the students in the Creative Arts Industry. In this paper it is argued that the Creative Arts Industry denies the student a space for finding anything more than the ordered individualistic Apollonian worldview.

This one dimensional outlook on the arts is commented on by Giacomo Gambino (1996) as a reflection on the politics in ancient Greece. The need for stability and order in the Greek tragic stage play demonstrated the need for the ruling class in Ancient Greece to achieve stability and order in the state. This was not to last, as in time the poets writing the tragedies felt that the Apollonian expression lacked the spontaneity and sense of abandon within the intensity of the experience of the performance of the play (see Gambino). Enframed by their Apollonian understanding of the artwork, a parallel might be drawn with the creative arts graduate. The sense of art or music in particular being so narrowly defined without the experience of art as community, denies the graduate and the students in their charge when entering schools the opportunity to see the arts as 'community making.'

In implementing the industrialization of the arts, attention is drawn to the recent efforts by the United Kingdom government to place the arts 'specialist' in the vanguard of arts education. This has been done by promoting a culture of excellence, offering places at high cost private arts schools for those trained outside the school. The opportunity that is offered is not therefore for all but only for those able to achieve a high level of executant skills. This becomes a reinscription of Apollonian individualism that is seen to be achieved at the expense of initial teacher education and ultimately those who do not have access to private tuition. The nature of classroom and making in the Dionysian sense is thus undermined by these initiatives

## Nietzsche, Apollo, Dionysus and the Creative Arts Industries

In any discussion of Nietzsche and the arts, the Greek gods Apollo and Dionysus are central. It is these deities that for Nietzsche represent the controlled and logical dream world, as seen in Apollo, and the abandonment of control in an intoxicated ecstasy in Dionysus. Nietzsche's interpretation of the ancient Greek tragic stage play and its evolution in Greek society is derived from this understanding of the two

mythical divinities. The Dionysian chorus, as it figures in Nietzsche's account of performance in the tragic stage play is the location of the Dionysian in this text. (see Nietzsche, 1873).

Nietzsche develops his concept of the arts experience in relation to what he terms the Will. This concept of Will and that of individualism or (dis) individualism within art making, is understood by Nietzsche as truth in art (see *Birth of Tragedy*). Nietzsche saw the Dionysian manifestation as an energy that opens new vistas for the artist within a community. Apollo the god of the dream or illusion holds the rational principles of order and sobriety. In likening the arts to industry, the rational principles of ownership, ranking and individual excellence are made prominent. This 'illusion' is countered by Dionysus, a god who abhors the Apollonian dream, who allows the overwhelming primal force within nature to preside. Dionysus is seen as the God of intoxication, according to Greek legend, who killed by the Titans and rises again in the within the Greek tragic stage play (see *Birth of Tragedy*).

Nietzsche saw the adoption of Apollo as Greek society's response to the threat of the chaos that it foresaw in the Dionysian underlay of their civilization. While accepting that Greek culture survived chaos only by adopting Delphic or Apollonian belief he remarks: 'The Greeks learned gradually to organize the chaos because, in accordance with the Delphic teaching, they directed their thoughts back to themselves, that is, to their real needs, and let the apparent needs die off' (Nietzsche, 1873). There is something reminiscent in this in relation the industrial connotation of the arts. That is an avoidance of what lies beyond the utilitarian, that which cannot be assimilated within a 'managed' industrial concept.

In time, according to Gambino (1996), to preserve their sense of identity, the Greek state sought to impose Apollonian values on Greek society as a whole. This was achieved through the prominence given to those who were seen as the protectors of the Greek state. The emphasis on the Apollonian hero grew into a focus on the individual and individual achievement. Nietzsche writes, 'one might even describe Apollo as the magnificent divine image (Götterbild) of the principium individuationis' (*Birth of Tragedy*: 17). Apollo as the deity of 'pleasure in appearance,' was also the divine sponsor of the illusion that made life worth living. Thus 'illusion' became the basis, according to Nietzsche, of the form of the Apollonian artwork. Nietzsche describes this 'dreamlike' vision as naïve, or sentimental, where the Apollonian illusion of individual heroism is captured in art form. In a discussion of Homer and the *Iliad* he adds:

Homeric 'naïveté' can be understood only as the complete victory of Apollonine illusion; it is an illusion of the kind so frequently employed by nature to achieve its aims. The true goal is obscured by a deluding image; we stretch out our hands towards the image, and nature achieves its goal by means of this deception (*Birth of Tragedy*: 25).

Nietzsche sees Apollonian art as naïve in that it obscures the true goal of life. That true goal is for Nietzsche the Dionysian experience. In the Apollonian vision, as in the narrative of Homer's *Iliad*, the Greek writers found a means to promote the Greek ideal of the all-conquering Olympian hero, vanquishing foreign foes and displaying supreme individual accomplishment. In this period (see Silk and Stern, 1981) the Greek elite sought to maintain control by re-telling those myths extolling the accomplishments of heroes, promoting unity and loyalty to the state. In time the later poets, defying the state, sought to reintroduce the Dionysian experience into the tragic stage play, having grown tired of Apollonian over-valuing the hero. By then the tragic stage play had become, 'both a reminder of the frailty of the political identity and a therapy for the insecurities brought on by all identities, by making them more unfamiliar, strange, and distant, it also warned against a boundless life in which humans have no horizons, place, and identity' (Gambino, 1996: 416).

The parallel with the Creative Arts industry and the political determination of the ancient Greek state cited in Gambino is compelling. The Apollonian fixation with order and political stability is reminiscent of a global media controlling the vision of what life is or 'could be'. Within the Apollonian concept of the Creative Arts Industry, the need for a product and market position agrees with the concept of 'studio pedagogy' where a point of difference can be made with the perceived Dionysian turmoil of 'classroom pedagogy.' The 'fragility' of containing the arts in this Apollonian wrapping seems bizarre. With the growing realisation that music exists outside the institution in a variety of different and more connected ways

the insistence on musicians preserved rather like an endangered species seems bizarre. The Creative Arts Industry therefore becomes more of a service to those privileged enough, to have afforded the many years of private lessons to now able to join this exclusive club.

The tragic legend was for Nietzsche a form of therapy for the insecurities brought on by recognition of the fragility of Apollonian illusion. The Apollonian myth warned against the boundless or Dionysian extremes that were seen by the Greeks as beyond knowledge of the self and the conscious individual. Thus the heroic tales of the Iliad were also a recognition of political boundaries. Beatrice Han-Pile (2006), describes the artist working by creating and destroying works within Dionysian intoxication as something beyond the seen and sensually perceived and understood world. This is the space of the Dionysian world artist, who creates and destroys in a revaluation of values. This is in contrast with the Apollonian artist who treats the world as illusion or a dream. As Nietzsche remarks in relation to Dionysus:

Man is no longer an artist, he has become a work of art: all nature's artistic power reveals itself here, amidst shivers of intoxication, to the highest, most blissful satisfaction of the primordial unity. Here man, the noblest clay, the most precious marble, is kneaded and carved and, to the accompaniment of the chisel-blows of the Dionysiac world-artist (Birth of Tragedy: 19).

It is within the Dionysian engagement that the artist remakes the work of art. This revaluation of values within Dionysian art-making is particularly apt for music. In the music classroom this is demonstrated as vitality in music as those learning are engaged in remaking and reinventing who they are in revaluing their world. This calls for teachers who are practised and able to see the potential for the class to remake themselves within the space of the classroom. The work in a class is not ruled by an ability to demonstrate superlative skills after countless hours of practice but as a place where the class can destroy and remake something of themselves in the moment of making. The kind of music that is described constantly reinvents itself according to the circumstances of the performance. It is within this Dionysian abandon that Nietzsche sees the revealing of Dionysian truth. The experience is a sensate response of the whole body to the experience in responding to music as a communal as opposed to individual experience. It is in the chorus of the tragic stage play that Nietzsche saw the truth of the artwork. This conceptual space is where the players create who they are. It is within this culturally defined space that things happen. Music in terms of an individualised product can never reflect this communal intensity as music that is prescribed does not arise from within Dionysus. As Allison remarks:

In the Dionysian state of intense excitement and agitation, one is dispossessed – removed – of one's own individuality, of all that renders the individual a singular and distinctive creature in the first place – the specific constitution of his character, personality, tastes, fears, expectations, reflections, and values (Allison, 2001: 40).

It is that effect of disindividuation, in Nietzsche's terms, that is a more natural primal being in which codes of behaviour are challenged in acts of constant creation and recreation. The Apollonian experience is one where there is not a sense of the students remaking of themselves in the concept of an industrial sense of the arts as in industry standardization. How then does this emphasis on the Apollonian as opposed to the Dionysian within the Creative Arts Industries make any impact on schooling and why, to justify the title of this paper, is the label of service industry attached?

### **Arts Specialists are not Arts teachers**

In schools in the United Kingdom (UK), with the emphasis now on mathematics, literacy, science and technology the position of the arts in education has become very precarious. The low esteem that the arts are held in the curriculum is reflected in initial teacher education where the emphasis is firmly placed on the other subjects of the curriculum. The UK governments' preferred route for anyone interested in arts education is now a three-year specialist degree followed by a one-year post graduate course. The argument is

made that these students will have the necessary subject knowledge to teach, but will they necessarily have the aptitude to see beyond curriculum guidelines and targets. As Hargreaves notes the narrowness of their initial training may leave a lot to be desired:

In many parts of the UK, their customary pre-service teacher education route is often conservatoire or university music department focused, with relatively little emphasis on pedagogy until the final phase. Although these teachers may be better prepared in terms of the depth of their musical knowledge, they need not necessarily be better at the actual process of teaching (Hargreaves et al., 2003: 180).

The situation in New Zealand is similar. Specialist courses in education and the arts at undergraduate level have been removed. A one year post graduate diploma in teaching is all that is offered in preparation for classroom teaching. This curriculum emphasis has also led to a drastic reduction in arts education provision within the primary Bachelor of Education (B.Ed). The effect of these cuts has led in turn to the demise of the arts in schools. For the child the only recourse is to seek music beyond the classroom. Yet ironically this is often impossible to achieve as the level of expertise demanded of the youth orchestra demands that students start at a very young age. Music provision outside the school is thus sadly removed from the experience of most children in mainstream schools.

Schools are no longer seen as places where the arts are necessary. This reflects the narrow competitive nature of society where parents focus on individual achievement rather than any sense of communal integration. In the UK, the government has exacerbated the sense of disempowerment by promoting the specialist. The Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted) have released a series of reports that have sought to improve music provision by promoting the specialist going into schools. *Tuning In* (2004) is one such initiative. The emphasis is not seen in the class music lesson but in the hands of the expert, the specialist, a product of the new Creative Arts Industry coming to the aid of the beleaguered 'generalist' teacher. The main points of *Tuning In* can be summarised as:

- to give as many pupils as possible access to *specialist* instrumental tuition during Key Stage 2 for a trial period
- to provide new musical experiences for large numbers of pupils, before they embark on *specialist* tuition, so that they see and hear the range of instruments available to them through workshops, performances and demonstrations
- to provide pupils with musical skills and experiences which form secure foundations and which prepare them for *individual* instrumental *choices*
- to build on the new musical experiences and musical *skills* programmes, to give access to sustainable *specialist* tuition for all pupils who wish to be involved for a trial period
- to ensure sustainability from the trial period for all pupils who choose to continue beyond this initial stage (Office for Standards in Education, *Tuning In*: 2004)

The emphasis is on *specialist* instrumental tuition with taster experiences prior to starting lessons so as to *whet* the appetite. The involvement of private music services providing individual music tuition for the students, means that the report becomes in effect a promotion. There is passing mention of the involvement of teachers but what will that really mean? The message is clear, *real music* is provided by instrumental tutors and specialists going into schools. There are other initiatives in England that have followed, perhaps the most alarming being the promotion of private arts schools as in the DfES *Music and Dance* scheme subtitled *Access to Excellence*. The use of the words *excellence* explains a great deal about the scheme. This initiative is part of the *Music Manifesto*, promoted as a way to reinvigorate all forms of music from popular to classical. However an assisted places scheme at the top choir schools and dance schools will only draw from those who have already benefited from intensive preparation in dance or music to be able to take up these places. The introductory literature is clear:

The aim of the scheme is to help identify, and assist, children with exceptional potential, regardless of their personal circumstances, to benefit from world-class specialist training as

part of a broad and balanced education, which will enable them, if they choose, to proceed towards self-sustaining careers in music and dance (DfES, Music and Dance Scheme Advisory Group Report: 2000/01)

The emphasis would clearly put this into *Billy Elliott* school of dreams, and access to such a scheme has been questioned. Sadly the promotion of individual excellence is never far from the surface in the Music Manifesto, promoting the privatized classical training in music or dance. This is a continuation of the drift away from the class music teacher toward the vision of the Creative Arts Industry. As Polly Curtis wrote at the time of the Manifesto launch: ‘Some musicians who have been lobbying the government for a stronger commitment to music in schools refused to attend the event, saying that without extra funding, or a firm commitment to give every child access to a musical instrument, the promises were empty’ (Curtis: 2004). Those in government keen to promote a vision of excellence ignored the dilemma, as Estelle Morris the minister of Arts pronounced, ‘Today's children are tomorrow's talent. If we are to remain at the forefront of global music making, we must ensure we offer the widest possible music education for young people’ (Curtis: 2004). The promotion of the arts in schools takes on a different emphasis at this point as it is not a promotion of the arts to all children but a promotion for some. The word *talent* sees the intention not to promote a sense of music making in the community but a provision for those who may become leaders in a global arts industry. Mary Boustead of the Association of Teachers and Lecturers (ATL) saw the fate of school music more clearly:

This is a small step to redress this problem but it is not enough. Even Ofsted acknowledges that primary school teaching is overloaded with literacy and numeracy which leaves little or no time for a rich and broadly based curriculum. This is the crux of the problem, so whilst we welcome the initiative, what is needed is a rebalance of the primary curriculum so that young children can be inspired, challenged and changed by their learning in school (Curtis: 2004).

The position is that government initiatives to raise standards in schools falls back on the promotion of the individual through places offered in specialist schools. The widespread support for instrumental staff in primary schools, and the promotion of what David Milliband described as a ‘route map’ for the future of music in schools makes the case plain to see.

### **The Artist as Educational Entrepreneur**

What happens to the student, whose vision is maintained within the scope of the private teacher, who completes the Creative Arts degree, and enters the profession. Some are enlisting in one of the companies offering arts education to schools. Such organizations as ‘Artis’ or ‘Bigfoot’ in the UK act as ‘entrepreneurs’ that can be called upon to teach in schools. Sadly the lack of contact with schools that these students from the Creative Arts Industry have experienced is such that when they enter mainstream schools they do not see children as artists. In maintaining their Apollonian legitimacy the new entrepreneurs see school students as consumers. Schools are not seen as spaces where children can be artists in the Dionysian sense but with reference to Apollonian excellence are only understood within the confines of the studio. Many teachers similarly see their role as leading not educating, as in drawing out ideas from the class.

While the visiting musician is nothing new, it is now the turn of the artist entrepreneur who comes with a specialised curriculum for children who inevitably become the clients in this industrial relationship. Such examples as *Rappaspeare* produced by Big Foot, show what is now on offer (see Bigfoot website). The arts entrepreneur who appears on the company website is a trained professional who lets us know that he decided that, ‘he might as well do some teaching’ (Bigfoot Website). The website includes an extract from one his lessons. He is recorded in an interview teaching a highly syncopated version of the three witches ‘hubble bubble toil and trouble,’ to a bemused collection of primary school students. The Bigfoot entrepreneur continues to direct his students as actors in his own mini-production. The practice reveals a form of teaching that holds little challenge but plenty of photo opportunities for school brochures or parent assemblies. Another indication of the work produced by the arts specialist is provided by Artis in their

multicultural project based on the Anancy stories. The impression is that we are seeing a re-enactment of the Anancy stories with verbatim suggestions.

Learn Song no.40 'Anancy the Spiderman'. Try devising some rhythmic accompaniment with shakers or bongo drums. Use this song at the beginning and end of the story. When telling the story, compose musical motifs for the main characters with instruments. Use voices for the laughter or forest sounds. Play Caribbean Fruit Salad: Pineapple, Mango, Star Fruit, Banana (Artis Website Key Stage 2 Lessons)

Sure enough we get a pre-composed song nicely sanitized by the publishers A.C. Black team (see, Black, 1984) and more unproblematic but sadly dated concepts of what living in the Caribbean must be about: 'Introduce the traditions of Caribbean story telling including that often stories would be told under a tree in a space that would be swept clean and a drum hit to tell that the story telling was about to begin. Everyone would then sit in a circle' (Artis Website Key Stage 2 Lessons).

Here we have the specialists completing the task of teaching using an outdated stereotype of life in the Caribbean. Not the best *product* for children in schools having to face the daily reality of life in the cosmopolitan cities of the UK. These experts and organisations reveal how they do not understand schools and classrooms. Being studio based the entrepreneurs avoid what art means beyond the controlled Apollonian form. On entering the school of music, art, dance or drama the overriding impression is that this is an industrial enterprise. The industry of music becomes performance based locked into a nineteenth century teacher apprentice model of being. The composers compose what will sell, the jazz musician improvises what is assured an audience, pianists and violinists are there to fill a void in the classical music industry. Dionysian 'improvisation' serves no purpose in this market-driven model. Crossing boundaries of the political or radical will be felt as a Dionysian threat to Apollonian security as in the account given by Gambino (1996).

## Conclusion

What does this mean if we are to make sense of this philosophical picture of Dionysian abandon? Can being who we are, through the disindividuated self occur within the Creative Arts Industry? Tied to an industrial interpretation art, means that art is only seen within the confines of what can be read as acceptable to the industry. What is acceptable does not allow for the local as that contradicts the terms of international global marketing. The sense of being who you are cannot operate when the cultural hegemony of whatever style remains predominant. Executant ranking by ability cannot be achieved if the requirement is to perform in a shared domain of Dionysian revaluing. If sharing is more important than executant ability this threatens competition, a lynchpin of industrial decision-making. If there is no Apollonian ordering, the dabbling of a child is as deserving of merit as the performance of a concert pianist.

The image of the child making the sand sculpture only to knock it down at the moment of completion (see Nietzsche, *Birth of Tragedy*) is a powerful reminder of the power of being the maker and re-maker. This image undermines the one-size fits all approach to art. There is in Dionysianism, a sense of art being remade according to who the artist is. This links well to the disindividuated contemplation of what art is to the child. The child makes according to who they are on the day. It is a nonsense to suggest that a package supplied by an external agency can achieve a complete performance. The mistaken value placed on competence and skill level in the promotion of the arts in manifestos and government initiatives reveals not an enlightened acceptance of making according to who the students are, but a narrow definition based on an understanding of the arts as an industrial enterprise.

In turning to a philosophical reading of art and music, do we find any arguments to halt the movement away from classroom practice in higher education training? The classroom is seen as a space where disruption, difference a non-alignment within Apollonian rationality prevails. Classroom music lessons become a melting pot where variation in codes of behaviour and skills base are plain. Here in this space it is not a question of mastery of form and skills but a space where the Dionysian potential lies for

diversity to be recognized and stimulated not removed in the quest for a reasonable version of a visiting teachers package. Nietzsche sees the creation of the work, in the moment of the reading, as a combined response from the performers. Here we find a community realizing a reevaluation of values. In the Creative Arts Industry forever hidebound by standardization and singularity the artist remains in the realm of the Apollonian order and rationality. It is the making of the work within the place of making that a Dionysian work is likely to arise from a class expression of who they are. The pastiche Beethoven quartet or a reply to the Modern Jazz Quartet has little to do with students living in a metropolis in the South Pacific or one of the major cities in the UK.

The Creative Arts Industry has in effect become a service industry that supplies goods for arts organisations and education. There is little interest in the arts as serving anything more than the survival of the Apollonian worldview as revealed in Gambino. The transparency of such a view of the world is masked by the lack of visibility of art as it connects with privilege in the mystery of aesthetics. When those trained in such a system emerge to work in schools their indifference to the classroom is reflected in their own lack of connection. By this means the Dionysian power of the arts remains hidden and the arts in turn remain an unknown entity in most students' experience. An industry has emerged where arts specialists are acting as service. With a teaching force denied any sustained training and entrepreneurs taking the role of teachers, school students become consumers within this industrial framing no longer to be seen as artists in their own right.

## References

- Allison, D. (1996). Some Remarks on Nietzsche's Draft of 1871, On Music and Words, *New Nietzsche Studies*, 1(1&2), 15-41.
- Curtis, P. (2004). Government launches schools music manifesto. *Guardian Unlimited* July 6th. Retrieved October 30<sup>th</sup>. from <http://education.guardian.co.uk/artinschools/story/0,13397,1255208,00.html>
- Department for Children School and Families (2002). *Music and Dance*. Retrieved October 30<sup>th</sup>. from <http://www.dfes.gov.uk/mds/>
- Department for Education and Skills (2000/01). *MBS Advisory Group Report*. Retrieved 30th October from <http://www.musicmanifesto.co.uk/>
- Gambino, G. (1996). *Nietzsche and the Greeks: identity, politics and tragedy*. Polity, 48(4), 415-444.
- Han-Pile, B. (2006). Nietzsche's metaphysics in the Birth of Tragedy. *European Journal of Philosophy*, 14(3), 373-403.
- Hargreaves, D.J., Welch, G.F., Purves, R., & Marshall, N. (2003). The identities of music teachers. In R. Kopiez, A.C. Lehmann, I. Wolther and C. Wolf (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 5th triennial European society for the cognitive sciences of music conference* (179-181). Hanover: Hanover University of Music and Drama.
- Nietzsche, F. (1873). *Use and abuse of history*. Translated by I. Johnston. Retrieved June 1st, 2007, from <http://www.mala.bc.ca/~Johnstoi/Nietzsche/history.htm>
- Nietzsche, F. (1999). *The birth of tragedy and other writings*, edited by R. Geuss and R. Speirs. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Office for Standards in Education. (2004). *Tuning In*. Retrieved June 13th, 2007 from <http://www.ofsted.gov.uk/publications/index.cfm?fuseaction=pubs.summary&id=3591%5D.8a08c08a0c/?vgnnextoid=c1561e7a681eb010VgnVCM2000003607640aRCRD>
- Silk, M.S., & Stern, J.P. (1981). *Nietzsche on tragedy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

## Websites:

- Music Manifesto. Retrieved October 30<sup>th</sup>., from <http://www.musicmanifesto.co.uk/>
- Artis: <http://www.artiseducation.co.uk/>
- Bigfoot: [http://www.bigfoot-theatre.co.uk/index.cfm/pcms/site.School\\_programmes.Primary.Primary\\_home/](http://www.bigfoot-theatre.co.uk/index.cfm/pcms/site.School_programmes.Primary.Primary_home/)

## Textbook

- Roberts, S (ed.) (1984) *Mango Spice*, London: A.C.Black