Philosophy of Education Society of Australasia (PESA)

Annual Conference 2003

Old Government House

University of Auckland

28-29 November 2003

Abstracts

Truth-telling as parrhesia; the disclosure of sexual abuse in school

Tina Besley
University of Glasgow

Abstract:

Foucault's (1991) work on parrhesia -- truth-telling or free speech -- is used in this paper to analyse how truth-telling in school can be a risky business for students. The first part of the paper sets out Foucault's works on the concept parrhesia. The second part uses one teenager's story as an exemplar to examine the risk in disclosing sexual abuse to a school counsellor. It is argued that this sort of disclosure is fulfils the criteria of parrhesia (as discussed by Foucault) since there is considerable risk associated with the compulsion that young people experience in our culture, in having to tell the truth about themselves.

Hamlet's Loss

Peter Bray
University of Auckland

Abstract:

Recent thinking on the traditional roles of philosophy and theology derived from a current concern with spiritual matters in Europe and North America has opened up an interesting forum for the discussion of spirituality as a 'lived' and transforming experience. This broad dialogue engages those who wish to draw together those contributions brought by New Science with those of traditional eastern and western value and belief systems. The notion of transformation, pertinent to how we come by knowledge, is considered alongside what Grof calls 'Spiritual Emergency' (SE).

It is claimed that if adolescent students have what might be understood as spiritual lives they may on occasion be disrupted and transformed by powerful experiences. Through a discussion of a case of SE, exemplified by Shakespeare's classic adolescent Hamlet, it is argued that more thought be given to the notion of adolescent 'inner' transformation in schools. More particularly, in this original application of Grof's holotropic theory it is suggested that education might support opportunities for transformation created by loss in adolescence.

The Falsity of Evidence Based Practice

Neil CM Brown
College of Fine Arts
The University of New South Wales

Abstract

The fallacy of implication is committed whenever evidence is applied as the basis rather than the grounds for the justification of a claim or action. While the best evidence may be involved in practical reasoning, even the telling of lies, there is nothing in evidence itself that eliminates the need for judgment in deciding how to go on. This paper understands the role of evidence within practice as a function of the agency apportioned to it by practical reasoning. It argues that because all evidence originates within meaningful judgments the very intelligibility of evidence, especially the outcomes of practice itself, may falsely imply a course of action. By reference to examples in the use of evidence, including the Cochrane doctrine, the pre-Socratic concept of metis, the politics of weapons of mass destruction, the treatment of prostate cancer, and the teaching of boys with learning difficulties, this paper argues the disengagement of evidence from the ethics of practice.

Cyclical Practitioner Research: a Lacanian Model

Tony Brown and Janice England
School of Education
University of Waikato

Abstract:

In this paper we discuss how we might understand the notion of the researcher as a participant in practitioner research in education. A central theme of our concern is with how the identity of this researcher is constructed and evolves in relation to the educational concerns being researched. The paper sets out to show how a theoretical model derived from Lacanian psychoanalysis might be put to work in achieving this. In particular Lacan's notions of the Imaginary, Symbolic and Real are used as frameworks in which a teacher mediates her sense of self and her sense of the professional world that she occupies. It illustrates, through examples of writing from a specific research project, how one teacher-researcher has used this approach in order to create a greater understanding of her own evolving identity of her as researcher through an emancipatory research process. This comprises a re-conceptualisation of the familiar cyclical hermeneutic action research methodology in which the identity formation of the researcher is seen as a function of the narrative product of the research enquiry.

Academic Freedom and the Commodification of Knowledge in the Modern University

Professor John Codd
Massey University

Abstract:

Historically, universities have been institutions that performed an essential role in the criticism and growth of knowledge. Within a western liberal democratic tradition the autonomy of universities from control by the state has been a necessary precondition for this role. Universities have been institutions supported by but independent from governments with a mandate and a responsibility to challenge orthodoxy, to investigate controversial topics and to express unpopular or dissident views. Fulfilment of this responsibility is only possible if universities have institutional autonomy in determining what to teach and to research, and if academics have academic freedom in the performance of those activities. This academic freedom and autonomy entails both rights and duties, but it is also predicated on epistemological assumptions about the nature of knowledge itself and the place of research, scholarship and criticism in the pursuit of knowledge. This paper questions whether academic freedom is possible in the modern university and argues that the university's time-honoured role as 'critic and conscience of society' is being negated by hegemonic neoliberal ideology and commodified modes of knowledge production. It argues that the new positivism in education policy, combined with the forces of globalization, is changing the traditional nature and purposes of universities.

Oh my students, there are no students!

Nesta Divine
University of Waikato

Abstract:

Jacques Derrida in The politics of friendship (1997, orig, 1994) discusses Aristotles' (perhaps) assertion that 'my friends, there are no friends' and Nietzsche's rather sardonic version 'enemies? There are no enemies! And in so doing raises some interesting questions about the nature of friendship. He interprets Nietzsche's revision as being concerned with learning: it is our enemies we learn from, rather than our friends, because at the heart of friendship there is a tacit agreement not to challenge the other too far. I wish to reflect on this argument in relation to pedagogy. Are amical relationships conducive or inimical to teaching and learning?

Equity and epistemology in higher education: the case for social constructionism

Henk Eijkman
 University of Canberra

Abstract

For working class, Indigenous, and geographically isolated students, systemic equity in higher education is a burning issue especially in distance learning, where their course completion rates are lowest, a situation unlikely to improve in web-based distance learning. Yet, the research literature gives little attention to equity in web-based higher education, let alone the underpinning philosophical assumptions that play a major role in educational disprivileging. This paper argues that the current focus on access, while necessary, is insufficient to ensure equality in educational engagement. Moreover, a technological shift to web-based learning will only lead to institutional equity if it is accompanied by a philosophical shift that integrates a 'participative' approach to social justice with a critical social constructionist curricular practice. The paper concludes by examining the ways in which web-based distance education can support social constructionist curricular practices to increase the educational engagement of working class, Indigenous and geographically isolated students in higher education.

The end of Kant-in-himself: Nietzschean Difference

Peter Fitzsimons
University of Auckland

Abstract:

19th Century German philosophy was to a large degree underpinned by Kant's metaphysics with the ideal of the rational human being as the basis for ethical responsibility. Liberal thought promoted the twin threads of freedom and equality, with Kant extolling the virtue of autonomy and respect for persons as ends-in-themselves.

Although Kant had moved away from 'faith in God' as the source of ethical commitment, Nietzsche still criticised him as a 'cunning Christian' in that a leap of faith was still required – into the realm of transcendent reason. With no justification other than itself, universal reason was to be the bedrock of morality. Kant's 'categorical imperative' and his notion of 'duty' required a commitment to the universal good – a secularisation of the ultimate and unknowable realm outside of human perception and sensation.

Upholding Schopenhauer's rejection of universal and transcendent ideals, Nietzsche posited Will to Power rather than rational essence as the driver for humanity; he promoted embodied, worldly presence – the real rather than an idea(l) of heavenly salvation or deified truth; and espoused individual character over equality or social conformity. Although holding a deep respect for Christ himself, Nietzsche ridiculed the Christian technology of subservience and self-denial. He also refused any morality that relied on an afterlife or a higher realm for salvation, believing instead that the life worth celebrating is of this world

Obstacles and possibilities: Ethics education with pre-service teachers

Mark Freakley
School of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning
Griffith University

Abstract:

I am a member of an endangered species in teacher education: I teach a compulsory undergraduate course that falls under the umbrella of philosophy of education. What I attempt to do in this course is response to the challenge that my university's mission statement presents. The Mission Statement proclaims, amongst others, the following values: "individual rights, ethical standards and social justice; personal growth and development . . . and life fulfilment" However, it seems that there are many obstacles to expressing these values in action and that students and teachers, together, are faced with an enduring problem in making their personal and institutional practices ethically or morally sound and coherent. The course I convene aims to prepare students to better respond to this ethical challenge by promoting the value of ethical inquiry and educating students in its practice. The course has undergone a number of changes over the years because I've come to better appreciate that there some unique potential obstacles facing anyone wanting to teach in this area. In this paper I describe some of these obstacles in the belief that knowing what the problem is is useful for anyone wanting to address it. I will also describe the way in which we have attempted to respond to these obstacles.

Philosophers as Children – Playing with Truth in the Philosophy of Education

Andrew Gibbons
University of Auckland

Abstract:

Valuing and exploring experiences of difference, within the philosophy of education, requires critical examination of the construction of childhood. As work is opposed to play, rational to emotional, and reality to fantasy, the adult is opposed to the child. This work troubles these historically influential distinctions so as to play with construction of the knowledgeable philosopher of education, and in particular to explore how the child's relationship to the truth might offer some guidance in aspiring to play the fool. The child subject characterised by the themes of playfulness, emotion, and irrationality is compared to the work of Friedrich Nietzsche, Ludwig Wittgenstein and Michel Foucault. The artist-philosopher is shown to be in many ways analogous with the contemporary child subject of developmental discourse, the child that is to be the subject of a developmentally theorised education. The analysis contributes to the exploration of themes of truth, the search for challenges to styles of philosophy in education, and to the deployment of a irrational, emotional and playful child subject to reclaim a care for the philosophical self. Transforming the philosopher into the child might then offer up opportunities to challenge the tradition of inculcating children with the 'truth' about the world.

Difference: a Critical Investigation of the Arts

Dr Elizabeth Grierson
Auckland University of Technology

Abstract

Within a context of research undertaken for The Politics of Knowledge: a Poststructuralist Approach to Visual Arts Education in Tertiary Sites (Grierson, 2000) this paper brings a critical focus to the literature on difference and the arts in education. At the time of commencing doctorate research (1996) little had been written of a critical nature about art education and the politics of difference. Even today, there is a significant lack of critically engaged literature and debate. Alongside the global return to empirical research in education there has been an apparent desire in the arts to reinvent a humanistically inspired 'self-efficacy' to creative practice, coupled with the formulas for a political alignment of creativity with industry. The outcome is a withering of attention to the politics of difference on the vine of educational philosophy, policy and practice. The paper argues that this vine must be opened to a renewed critical analysis and the visibility of difference recognised if the arts are to hold or gain any purchase in the stakes of education in a global world.

Learning and Competence: A Different Approach

Paul Hager
University of Technology, Sydney

Abstract

The notion of competence has received sustained and ongoing attention from philosophers of education in recent years (e.g. Lum, Hyland, Bridges, Hager & Beckett). Despite this, many important matters remain unclear. This paper argues that much of the confusion can be traced to both proponents and opponents of competence variously sharing certain assumptions about learning that revolve around viewing it as a product. These assumptions are highly questionable and include:

> There is one best kind of learning.
> Learning that is non-transparent is inferior.
> Learning centres on the stable and enduring.
> Learning is replicable.

An examination of various writings about competence demonstrates the pervasive influence of these assumptions on both proponents and opponents of competence. The result is ambiguity and equivocation as both camps run together items that are logically and conceptually distinct.

It will be argued that to advance these matters we need to distinguish clearly between the following three items:

> Performance and its outcomes. Performance relates to an activity of some kind.
> The underpinning constituents of competence (capabilities, abilities, skills). These are attributes or properties of people.
> The education, training or development of people to be competent performers.

These distinctions are wholly consistent with an alternative conception that views learning as a process (or, more accurately, as a dialectical interplay of process and product). This emerging conception of learning has strong roots in educational thought of the last hundred years or so. When these distinctions are maintained in an account of competence, it turns out that many of the criticisms made by philosophers of education fail. It also turns out, however, that the notion of competence lacks many of the superficially attractive features that appealed in the first place to the educationally unsophisticated.

Is Teaching A Practice?

Bruce Haynes
Edith Cowan University

Abstract:

MacIntyre has claimed that teaching is not a practice. This claim has been disputed by several authors, most recently those included in the May 2003 issue of The Journal of Philosophy of Education. In this paper it is argued that MacIntyre is both right and wrong.

Re-Minding Imagination

Felicity Haynes
The University of Western Australia,

Abstract:

Joel, eleven years old, was asked what he thought creativity was. "Creativity to me is just when you're imagining things and you put lots of imaginations together and you get one big imagining", he said. Despite the inclusion of "mind" in the titles of their recent books on creativity and imagination, the leading scholars in this area, Howard Gardner, Elliot Eisner and Kieran Egan have left little room for the purposive, conscious mind that Joel's statement implies. This paper uses Maxine Greene's writings to spur a reconstruction of the sort of dynamic mind necessary for thoughtful imagination to be fostered in education.

Empathy as a Fundamental Educational Value

Greg Heath
RMIT University

Abstract

It has been observed by many commentators that there is an "empathy deficit" in the world today. The lack of the capacity to imagine one's self in the place the other leads to racism and hatred that spills over into the violence of terrorism by states and fanatical organizations and individuals. This paper will explore the ideas of Cornelius Castoriadis that racism springs from self-hatred rather than hatred of the other as such. And that it can be overcome by the "cultural imaginary" in the form of self-recognition.

Difference for the Bogatanos:

Martin Henry

Abstract

The notion of difference as it is constituted in the west where the search for personal identity is well underway is privileged in current scholarship. However, in Bogota students embark upon a different journey of identity. For them patriotism is unquestioned, education is valued highly and Catholicism and meat rich diets unite most. Visiting this context with two Muslim colleagues threw up a number of interesting questions. How does the West's notion of identity work in the context of a Latin American culture? Colombia is a place that due to perception and real dangers lies at the fringe of European understanding of the America's and is in the European imagination a place of kidnappers and drug dealers. It is already produced as a place of difference. On an educational visit there it became increasingly clear that the educational difference lay in the apparently unified acceptance of some of the tenets of Colombian cultural identity. This taught us a great deal about the pluralism we experienced in inner city Leeds. This paper is an exploration of some of those differences.

The Subject of Difference as Constrained by Style

Richard Heraud
University of Auckland

Abstract:

There are ages in which the rational man and the intuitive man stand side by side, the one in fear of intuition, the other with scorn of abstraction" (Nietzsche, 1979, p. 90).

This paper will examine the above perceived conflict between the rational and the intuitive as a conflict governed by the manner in which claims to truth are served by a need for style. The question addressed is: how is the authenticity of difference to be conceptualized if claims to universal truth are inevitably unstable? This question will be problematized in relation to Sartre's existentialism and from the point of view of how we understand Foucault's concept that we should create the self as a work of art is served by Nietzsche's claim that we should be 'constrained by style'. To do this, a genealogical analysis of two blindly chosen academic texts will be made. The intention is to diagnose the orientation of the style evidenced in the rendition of the two texts in relation to claims to truth made in those texts.

Dogma or Difference and The Concept Of Alterity

Sandy Jump
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Abstract

In the construction of a new idea or formation of an old, what is not forgotten has made all the difference. And although the concept of difference is brought to play in various aspects of education and philosophy, it is hardly stated that its clear and grave distinction from, say, sameness, is in its relation to dogma. This clear and grave distinction lies both on the side of the educator and the one being educated---the practitioner and the learning individual. This is an ever more crucial question in talk of cultural diversity. Cultural-social sensitivity is imperative for the manner in which one conducts a classroom, but understanding the manner in which one is brought up to engage with the world is ever more crucial in conveying an idea while stimulating creative engagement with the text. By clear association with good teaching or education such engagement would presume removal of dogma and openness to invention. Should this be only on the side of teaching or does the side of learning run parallel? Thinking of this as a dualist one would be compelled to believe there is too great a distinction for them to be parallel. Intersubjectivity, however, does not take such a view. It does not contain within it a theory of identicals but it presumes a similarity within which communicative theory functions. Dualism is set on a foundational difference that although is helpful in the formation of ideas, and in turn helps transfer ideas, hampers the communicative project if it is heavily reliant on Cartesian skepticism as the upshot of extreme dualism. This in essence is what I try to demonstrate through a close examination of what Jean-Luc Nancy has to say about alterity, what social-historians say of culture and agency, and discussion of J. M. Murdoch's concern for alterity and formation of ideas.

Complexity As A Meta-Theory For Practice And Learning

Jeanette Lancaster
University of Technology, Sydney

Abstract:

What does 'learning from practice' mean? How can such learning be conceptualised? That there is work that illustrates how practice is contextualised in multiple ways suggests that practice can be usefully considered in relational terms. This raises the need for a theory of practice that takes relations, rather than objects, as its 'object'.

The field of complexity theory allows for such a focus. I elaborate on those aspects of complexity theory that are relevant to my topic in order to present a perspective of practice as a system constituted by complex relations, and the learning that arises from practice, as an emergent feature of such a complex system.

I review some of the consequences that follow from seeing practice and learning from practice in this way. These include an understanding of how practice can produce new knowledge, but also a recognition of the limitation of our capacity to control the discovery of this knowledge. They also include a need for new methodologies for exploration of the field.

Conceptualising Convergence

Lucinda Li
University of Auckland

Abstract

This paper discusses the notion of 'convergence' in relation to— recent debates about globalisation. Globalisation has become a major issue since the early 1990s, but despite an enormous amount of talk, discussion, and writing, globalisation remains a highly contentious issue. There are arguably three main schools of thought about globalisation: the (hyper)globalists, the sceptics, and the transformationalists. Each of these will be briefly introduced. Among these, the (hyper)globalists argue that globalisation is real and offer strong propositions about its outcome. They consider that convergence is the major, natural and inevitable result of globalisation occurring across all areas of economic and social life. Although the term 'convergence' has been frequently employed by the (hyper)globalists, it is often used with little or no definition.. What the term means, whether there are different forms of convergence, how these might be detected, and whether they can be 'measured' are important questions for which answers are only just emerging. The paper attempts to unpack the concept of convergence and thus improve the ongoing debates about globalisation.

Difference And The Event: The Educative Value Of The Creative Moment

David Lines
School of Creative and Performing Arts
University of Auckland

Abstract -

The binary division of theory and practice obscures our awareness and understanding of the educative value of the moment of learning. The qualities of educative events are, in fact, 'synchronous,' - they exude simultaneous differences of temporal meaning. The main premise taken in this paper is that teachers and students can become more attuned to the qualities and differences of educative moments if they question, consider and creatively probe the relational dimensions that come forth. By using the example of music, this paper asks questions about our philosophical and conceptual preconceptions of events and poses alternative ways of thinking about them. The paper draws on thinking and conceptual tools such as Nietzsche's 'will to power' and Heidegger's 'Eregenis' in order to build a picture of how educators can work with, and help build learning events creatively for the benefit of their students.

The Aesthetics of Difference

Janet Mansfield
Auckland University of Technology/University of Auckland

Abstract

The philosophical antecedents of music education were embedded within modernism and its universalising assumptions. In this context, the wider economics of power and privilege were submerged politically. If the Enlightenment, modernism and its major assumptions created the conditions for the moral, epistemological and aesthetic privileging of the individual author/artist/composer, then a postmodern questioning reveals modernism's difficulty in dealing with difference, its hierarchical notion of culture. In this paper, the foundational understandings of knowledge and morality, the 'purity' of Western canonicity and modern aesthetics are challenged as I examine the notion of the aesthetics of difference. I attempt to insert culture into aesthetics to energize cultural differentiation insofar as music education might nurture these processes. To theorize the concept of 'difference', I use the theories of poststructuralists Jacques Derrida and Jean François Lyotard.

Alternativism', 'Deep Diversity' And 'Constitutional Patriotism' As Responses To Social Difference And Citizenship : Prospects And Problems.

Marjorie O'Loughlin
University of Sydney

Abstract

In countries with an increasingly heterogeneous citizenry, discussion has focused on the manner in which culturally groups may be said to 'belong' to the nation. The more traditional view of citizenship has been widened to include the understanding that there may be multiple conceptions of citizenship residing within the one state. Three accounts of the plurality of ways of belonging are provided by Sven-Erik Nordenbo's notion of 'alternativism', Charles Taylor's conception of 'deep diversity' and the 'constitutional patriotism' of Jurgen Habermas. Each of these not only suggests that there may be a variety of ways of looking at citizenship but, particularly in the case of Taylor and Habermas, each is embedded within a larger philosophical framework encompassing specific views of social justice and the good life. Central to each is an account of communication

In this paper a brief exploration, comparison and critique of the three positions is undertaken, with emphasis on Taylor and Habermas. The centrality of the discourse principle is raised. It is argued that, the powerful account of communication provided by Habermas notwithstanding, theorisations of communication and participation need to address the issue of the 'social imaginary' (Castoriadis, Anderson, Kristeva), if they are to provide the most effective models for dealing with social differences and citizenship. Some questions for education are briefly raised.

Postemotions, Education and Difference.

Stuart Mundy-McPherson
University of Otago,

Abstract:

Stjepan Mestrovic has argued that contemporary western societies are animated by postemotions – 'post' in the sense of being against the emotions. Mestrovic draws on a number of sociological and philosophical views to formulate this concept, expressed most clearly in Postemotional Society (1997). Significant influences on Mestrovic are Arthur Schopenhauer, Emile Durkheim, Thornstein Veblen, David Riesman, Theodore Adorno and Herbert Marcuse. Postemotionalism has a number of features. Those which will be referred to here being about, mechanised habits and orientations of the emotions, vicarious emotions, a happy consciousness, being nice, prepackaged emotions, Balkanisation, post-other-directedness, an oppressive peer group, and inauthenticity.

Postemotions will be explained and discussed by reference to Mestrovic's own references to education, by way of educational references to the concept, and, by extrapolation to contemporary educational issues where difference is concerned.

On the Deep Purposes of Teaching and Learning

Dr. John Ozolins
Australian Catholic University, St. Patrick's Campus

Abstract

Most literature on teaching and learning concentrates on discussing the importance of students becoming independent learners and it has become commonplace to regard teaching as facilitating this. Older models which understood teaching as the transmission of knowledge and education as inculturation have generally been abandoned and a technicist model which demands learning to be measured in terms of explicit outcomes has been adopted. In this paper, I argue that newer models adopt a superficial understanding of the purpose of learning, tying it too closely to particular and specifiable outcomes. In fact, learning has much deeper purposes that have to do with the formation of character and the development of attributes such as attentiveness and openness to transcendent meaning. These deeper purposes are problematic because they are not amenable to specification in terms of explicit outcomes and the attributes elude capture by performance indicators. Moreover, if the deeper purposes are the real objectives of teaching, then any attempt to measure how much learning has taken place as a result of teaching is doomed to fail.

Intellectuals, Tertiary Education and Questions of Difference

Peter Roberts
University of Auckland

Abstract:

In contemplating the roles and responsibilities of intellectuals in the 21st century, the notion of 'difference' is significant in at least two senses. First, work on the politics of difference allows us to consider the question 'For whom does the intellectual speak?' in a fresh light. Second, we can ask: 'To what extent, and in what ways, might our activities as intellectuals make a difference?' Thinkers such as Foucault, Kristeva, Lyotard, and Bauman (among many others) are helpful in addressing these questions. This paper sketches some of the key ideas of these thinkers and assesses their relevance for an understanding of intellectual life in contemporary tertiary education institutions.

Minds, Brains, and the Concept of Personal Understanding

Derek Sankey
Hong Kong Institute of Education

Abstract:

If education is to make a difference, it is widely acknowledged that we must aim to educate for understanding, but this means being clear about what we mean by the concept of understanding. This paper will argue for a concept of personal understanding, recognising both the commonality and individuality of each pupil's understandings, and the relationship between understanding and interpretation, analysis and synopsis, in their quest for meaning.

The paper will consider the philosophical and neurophysiological reasons for asserting the individuality of human minds, brains, and the creation of personal meanings. This last move, however, would seem to run counter to the post-modern denial of the autonomous self, and the tradition in philosophy, most recently stemming from Wittgenstein, that insists that meanings and understandings are essentially social, and not personal. Moreover, my notion of personhood will bring me into conflict with John White's recent book, The Child's Mind. I will argue that meanings and understandings are both social (interpersonal) and personal, and that the term personal marks out our individuality and applies to all humanity. Once we reinstate the notion of personal minds and personal understandings, alongside the social, we may see more clearly what it means to educate for understanding, and why this might begin to make a difference.

Mea-alofa-A gift handed over: Reflections on research methodologies from a Samoan counselling perspective.

Byron Seiuli
University of Waikato

Abstract

This paper is a contribution to the theorizing on Pacific Research approaches specifically researched from a counselling background which incorporates a personal and Samoan perspective. It looks at the influences of Pacific and specifically Samoan models in order to theorize on useful approaches to researching Pacific peoples educational and social needs from a counselling context. This paper outlines some key features of Samoan and Pacific cultural understandings and protocols which holds intrinsic value that makes accessible helpful ways to work with Samoan clients successfully.

The Enlightenment concept of citizenship, rights and governance in Modern and Postmodern States

Robert Shaw
Open Polytech

Abstract

Citizenship is one of several Enlightenment concepts that together produce the moral / political rationale for the modern nation state. Claims about citizenship, democracy, rights and governance are today at the centre of debates about political hegemony, regime change, public opinion, school curricula and investment in education. This paper attempts to facilitate those debates. It provides an analysis of the concept of citizenship, based in the concept of rights, and an account of how the concept of citizenship operates in Cooper's modern and postmodern states. It is possible a new postmodern concept of citizenship will emerge, but so far attempts to extend the concept of citizenship to achieve this (for example Faulk's attempt) have required that its base links to rights and duties be corrupted, or that its relationship to 'democracy' and 'governance' be unacceptably weakened. One concept of citizenship, based primarily on rights, appears equally applicable in modern and postmodern states.

Are Ethics Committees Ethical?

Ivan Snook
Massey University.

Following the Cartwright Report, universities and other tertiary institutions were required to set up Human Ethics Committees. The original point of these committees was to protect participants in research. In the spirit of the university tradition these committees were to be collegial academic bodies and their major role was to be an educative one.

As the years have gone by, the role of these committees has changed. University administrators have been at pains to insist that the committees function within an autonomous institution where, even if they contain people from the community they are ultimately servants of the senior officer. The role has changed too: the educative role has been subtly replaced by a bureaucratic one and the point has been to protect the institution rather than the subjects. As a result, staff and students have been required to produce vast quantities of paper work.

Tertiary institutions have themselves undergone great changes towards being servants of the market rather than independent 'critics of society.' Much research is now commissioned by outside agencies and business money is keenly sought. Thus there is increasing pressure for research to be approved without too much ethical scrutiny which might hold up the research contract and alienate the funding agencies.

In this paper I will attempt to ask the question "what should ethics committees do?" and, by analysis of the documents at one institution try to ascertain what they in fact do. I want, in short to ask if these 'ethics' committees are actually ethical at all.

Nurse Educators and the Ethic of Care

Gilian Stokes
University of Auckland

Abstract:

Nursing has a long history of defining itself as a 'caring' profession underpinned by a philosophy of care. The integrity of nursing practice, and of nurses themselves, is challenged frequently by the context in which nursing care is delivered. Similar situations can arise within the context of nurse education in the tertiary sector where nursing lecturers have dual roles and responsibilities under the Education Act and the Nurses Act. In the case where the prima facie rights of the student under the Education Act conflict with the prima facie rights of the public under the Nurses Act nursing lecturers are faced with moral dilemmas. This is particularly the case in the management of students who have failed clinical practice placements and who present as an unacceptable risk to public safety. This paper will explore the challenges of these moral dilemmas for nurse educators within a framework of an ethic of care.

The Arts and Identity

Trevor Thwaites
Auckland College of Education

Abstract

Contemporary globalised educational settings dictate that students both identify with and speak the language of markets and commerce before considering any forms of cultural and personal expression. The well-being of the nation-state appears to rest on its ability to compete globally, with the assumption that public good will naturally follow. Education presents to its client-base a world full of entrepreneurial opportunities, spearheaded by literacy and numeracy strategies, the two canonised areas of learning hailed as the 'agents-of-change'. New definitions of culture have placed what expresses the identity of community at the margins and instead stress the ways in which communities are defined, categorised and controlled in an effort to seek a global, generic compliance.

This paper refutes these minimalist outcomes for education claiming that with a sense of identity and well-being in place, the commercial aspects will occur in meaningful and equitable ways. To effect such a change I propose the establishment of a vigorous arts education policy which would value alternative signifying systems and place difference as a thing of value rather than an act of deviancy. The arts are responsible for much of the intellectual processes and production of cultural expression and shape how we see, experience and interact with the world. We should see culture, not as a singular, but as layers of beliefs, knowledge and experiences that interact, intersect and intercede as the requirements of daily living demand. 'Culture' then takes on the role of filter through which we interpret our daily experiences, the 'real' becoming a product of negotiated and socially created meaning.

Ivan Illich, bell hooks, and Reflective Pedagogical Practice

Shaun Wakelin and Joe Diorio
UNITEC

Abstract

Ivan Illich did not write directly about reflective pedagogical practice, but his work can be deployed to critique current popular literature on such practice as a domestication of critical thinking about teaching and an institutionalisation of established public policy. We develop an Illichian critique of the literature on reflective practice, and contrast the anarchistic views of Illich with the critical pedagogy of bell hooks. hooks exemplifies an attempt to incorporate critical reflective pedagogy within existing educational institutions. Illich seemingly rejects these institutions, but shares liberatory objectives similar to those advocated by hooks.

This paper asks whether Illich's anarchistic tendencies are limited - or even contradicted - by his interest in community-based liberation. We distinguish the (arguably) individualistic foundations of Illich's notion of 'conviviality', with the more communitarian foundations of hooks' liberatory pedagogy. Our objectives are two-fold: first, drawing specifically on recent scholarship on Illich, we examine his critique of institutionalised education in light of the communitarian conceptions of critical pedagogy; and second, we orchestrate an Illichian critique of the domesticated 'reflective practice' industry as it is promoted currently in New Zealand education.

Education for Difference: Making education count and making it accountable

Mark Wall
University of Technology, Sydney

Abstract

Education is about making a difference. If it is not then it is not education. If it is aimed at making a difference and does not then it is not~~bad~~ education?~~.~~ Making a difference in someone's life has both a quantitative and a qualitative dimension. The quantitative dimension is one of volume even distance~~and technique~~, while the qualitative dimension is one of value.~~s.~~ Of course the two are not so easily winnowed, however they serve for the moment to support the further argument that education is not an end in itself. By this I mean both that the act of education and the state of having an education are not ends. I might also add that the process of being educated, learning in other words, is likewise not an end.

Some of this is possibly controversial yet none of it is to say that education must serve a purely technical or, as some have said, mechanical purpose. Instead, the idea here is to put education to work in the world. In a pragmatic sense, although my argument will go further, education as a 'light under a bushel' is particularly difficult to justify given the contemporary focus on outcomes. At the level of policy, if not philosophy, education needs to make a positive discernable difference in society.

In this paper I use a framework of conceptual analysis and normative justification, developed by the American philosopher William K. Frankena, to develop a philosophy of education for difference. The difference proposed is the absolute end and therefore the ultimate aim of education. Needless to say it is not being 'job ready' however there are proximate ends that might cater to this level of instrumentality. Nevertheless, the examination is not rooted in the current order of things, as my method of critical pragmatism places the immediate aim closer to the ideal than to today.

Centring The Subject In Order To Educate For Difference

Scott Webster
Monash University

Abstract

It is assumed here that education involves change, that is, the subject - the existing self - becomes different. However, it is observed that many of our youth experience disenfranchisement from educational programs such as commonly found in schools, and therefore fail to engage meaningfully with them and so are unable to become different in an educative sense. This paper attempts to propose a possible means for addressing this by centring the subject.

It is clear that the subject has been 'decentred' from discourses as is evident in the key learning areas that comprise many formal curricula. John Dewey and others have argued that the subject is not the author of the self and it is not proposed here that a leap be made from the objective to the subjective. However, Dewey does describe the individual self as a "centred organisation of energies" and argues that it is natural for beings to "exhibit preference and centeredness" (Dewey, 1958, pp. 208, 233). In order to explore how a centring of the subject may contribute to an educative difference of being, references shall be made mainly to Dewey's work on the transaction of organism and environment, and Kierkegaard's 'subjective truth'.